

**COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY  
KENTUCKY BOARD OF TAX APPEALS  
FILE NOS. K03-S-149 and K04-S-33**

**RUSSELL CHANDLER**

**APPELLANT**

**V.**

**ORDER NO. K-19316**

**JOHNSON COUNTY PROPERTY  
VALUATION ADMINISTRATOR**

**APPELLEE**

The Kentucky Board of Tax Appeals has delegated authority to a hearing officer pursuant to KRS 13B.030. The hearing officer entered a recommended order in compliance with the provision of KRS 13B.110. The Appellant filed exceptions to the recommended order. The Board has reviewed the record, the recommended order and the exceptions.

The Kentucky Board of Tax Appeals conducted a hearing of the cases in this matter on February 22, 2005 and made the following findings of fact, conclusions of law and recommended disposition.

**FINDINGS OF FACT**

These assessment appeals are for real property located at 19 Rolling Hills Road, Hager Hill, Kentucky for the tax years 2003 and 2004. The Johnson County Property Valuation Administrator assessed the property at \$150,000.00 in 2003 and at \$126,000.00 in 2004. The taxpayer or Appellant valued the property at \$65,000.00 in 2003 and \$100,000.00 in 2004. The Johnson County Board of Assessment Appeals valued the property at \$ 126,000.00 in 2003 and \$126,000.00 in 2004. The Appellant filed timely appeals from the local board with the Kentucky Board of Tax Appeals.

The Appellant offered the following evidence in support of Appellant's appeal:

The Appellant bought the property in 1971 for \$7,000.00 and the following year constructed a seven-room home consisting of three bedrooms and two baths. The square footage of the home shown by the Johnson County PVA is 2,516 square feet and by the Appellant as being 2,342 square feet. Also constructed on the property is a 12' x 16' storage building. Mr. Chandler offered two comparable sales. The first being property located at 30 Rolling Hills Road with an assessment of \$125,000.00 and square footage as shown by the PVA of 1,848 square feet. The second being property located at 33 Rolling Hills Road with an assessment of \$138,900.00 and square footage as shown by the PVA of 2,576 square feet. Mr. Chandler's home and building are insured for \$125,000.00 and according to Mr. Chandler the agent would not insure the property for less than the \$ 125,000.00.

The Johnson County Property Valuation Administrator, Michael Stafford, provided testimony from Mr. Paul Pack, Johnson County Attorney and Tammy Barnes, Certified Appraiser. They testified the valuation of \$126,000.00 the Johnson County Board of Assessment Appeals set was a fair and acceptable value of Mr. Chandler's property. They stated they could not get a true appraisal of the Appellant's property because the Appellant refused to allow the appraiser on the property so they could make an accurate appraisal.

It is the finding of this hearing that the Appellant did not sustain his burden of proof regarding his challenge to the final order of the Johnson County Board of Assessment Appeals.

Based upon the evidence in the record, it is the finding of hearing officer, Randall Phillips, that the fair cash value of the property in question is \$126,000.00 as of January 1, 2003 and \$126,000.00 as of January 1, 2004.

### CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

The Kentucky Board of Tax Appeals is vested with exclusive jurisdiction to hear and determine appeals from final rulings, orders and determinations of the Johnson County Board of Assessment Appeals pursuant to KRS 131.340(1).

The function of the Board is not simply to review the action of the Johnson County Board of Assessment Appeals, but to try anew the issues as presented. *Jefferson County Property Valuation Administrator v. Oxford Properties, Inc.*, Ky.App., 726 S.W.2d 317, 319 (1987). See KRS 131.340(1).

Section 172 of the Kentucky Constitution mandates that “all property shall be assessed for taxation at its fair cash value, estimated at the price it would bring a fair voluntary sale.”

The choice of the most appropriate and reliable approach to valuation is within the prerogative of the Board. *Jefferson County Property Valuation Administrator*, 726 S.W.2d at 319.

Regardless of the manner or method used by the Property Valuation Administrator or the decision of the Kentucky Tax Board of Appeals, the finding of valuation must be at its fair cash value, estimated at the price it would bring at a fair voluntary sale. *Helman v. Kentucky Board of Tax Appeals*, Ky.App., 554 S.W.2d 889 (1977).

As the party proposing that the Kentucky Board of Tax Appeals set aside the decision of the Johnson County Board of Assessment Appeals, the Appellants have the burden of proving a lower value. KRS 13B.090(7).

If the property is sold at or near the assessment date in a fair and voluntary sale, the sale price is usually the best evidence of the property's fair cash value. *Sears, Roebuck & Company v. Boone County Board of Assessment Appeals*, Ky.App., 715 S.W.2d 888, 889 (1986).

Based upon the facts as established in this hearing, the hearing officer concludes that the fair cash value of the subject property is \$126,000.00 as of January 1, 2003 and January 1, 2004.

### **RECOMMENDED ORDER**

It is recommended that the June 25, 2003 and the June 18, 2004 final rulings of the Johnson County Board of Assessment Appeals be sustained and the real property be assessed at a fair cash value of \$126,000.00 as of January 1, 2003 and \$126,000.00 as of January 1, 2004.

Each party shall have fifteen (15) days from the date any recommended order is mailed within which to file exceptions to the recommendations with the agency head. Transmittal of a recommended order may be sent by regular mail to the last known address of the party.

### **FINAL ORDER**

The Kentucky Board of Tax Appeals has considered the record and the exceptions filed and accepts the recommended order of the hearing officer, and adopts it as the Board's final order. Failure to file exceptions to an administrative hearing officer's recommendations after a hearing constitutes a failure to exhaust administrative remedies and precludes appellate review. *Swatzell v. Natural Resources and Environmental Protection Cabinet*, Ky App 962 SW 2d 866 (1998).

The June 25, 2003 final ruling and the June 18, 2004 final ruling of the Johnson County Board of Assessment Appeals is sustained and the real property is to be assessed at a fair cash value of \$126,000.00 as of January 1, 2003 and \$126,000.00 as of January 1, 2004.

The following information is provided pursuant to the final order requirements of KRS Chapter 13B:

This is a final and appealable order. All final orders of this agency shall be subject to judicial review in accordance with the provisions of KRS Chapter 13B. A party shall institute an appeal by filing a petition in the Circuit Court of venue, as provided in the agency's enabling statutes, within thirty (30) days after the final order of the agency is mailed or delivered by personal service. If venue for appeal is not stated in the enabling statutes, a party may appeal to Franklin Circuit Court or the Circuit Court of the county in which the appealing party resides or operates a place of business. Copies of the petition shall be served by the petitioner upon the agency and all parties of record. The petition shall include the names and addresses of all parties to the proceeding and the agency involved, and a statement of the grounds on which the review is requested. The petition shall be accompanied by a copy of the final order.

A party may file a petition for judicial review only after the party has exhausted all administrative remedies available within the agency whose action is being challenged, and within any other agency authorized to exercise administrative review.

A petition for judicial review shall not automatically stay a final order pending the outcome of the review, unless:

- (a) An automatic stay is provided by statute upon appeal or at any point in the administrative proceedings;
- (b) A stay is permitted by the agency and granted upon request; or
- (c) A stay is ordered by the Circuit Court of jurisdiction upon petition.

Order No. K-19316

Within twenty (20) days after service of the petition of appeal, or within further time allowed by the Circuit Court, the Kentucky Board of Tax Appeals shall transmit to the reviewing court the original or a certified copy of the official record of the proceeding under review in compliance with KRS 13B.140(3).

**DATE OF ORDER  
AND MAILING: May 18, 2005**

**FULL BOARD CONCURRING**

**NANCY MITCHELL  
CHAIR**